Chapter 4

A NEW E-FEMINIST PRAXIS ON TURKEY: ISLAMIC DIGITAL FEMINIST ACTIVISM

Senem GÜRKAN[1]

INTRODUCTION: A BRIEF LOOK ON THE HISTORY OF FEMINIST MOVEMENTS

"Feminism can be defined simply as women's perception of the order that oppresses them, defining them politically and developing methods of struggle against it, although there are various definitions of the term. Feminism differs within itself in terms of both the perception of this order and the creation of a policy to oppose it, and the social models to be created." (Çakır, 2014, p.416).

As stated in this very short definition, feminism is a movement that addresses the social movements, formations and ideologies related to the elimination of all inequalities against women in order to protect the rights of women as individuals.

In the historical process, the struggle of the feminist movement has split into various classifications and periods in terms of issues and forms of struggle with some nuances and different focuses, although demanding women's rights is basically a fixed purpose of each and every of these categorizations. In other words, with the spread and development of feminism, there have occurred some conceptualizations to separate the policies and paths followed by women in the feminist struggle, even if they are engaged in each other.

At this point, the First Wave Feminism, which was a process that covered almost two centuries, starting with Mary Wollstonecraft's "Advocacy of Women's Rights" in the mid-18th century, developed around concepts such as individuality, freedom and equality. During this period, the women's movement developed on the idea that women should have equal citizenship rights with men, such as accessing to education rights, voting, and participation in working life (Kolay, 2015; Baumgardner, 2011). It is accepted in the literature that this period ended with the granting of the right to vote to women in all states of America in 1919, following the suffragettes' struggle for voting rights in England (DuBois, 1997, p.273).

[1] Asst. Prof. Dr., Ondokuz Mayıs University, senemgrk@yahoo.com, ORCID iD: 0000-0002-2061-6385.

Starting in the 1960s, the Second Feminist Wave, which was institutionalized within the framework of the concepts such as difference, awareness raising, social equality and ending discrimination, focused on the female body and sexuality (Freedman, 2002). Thus, in addition to the legal gains within the First Wave, the need for a more radical and solidarity movement emerged. With the awareness of the concept of "gender" and with the effect of Simone de Beauvoir's saying, "One is not born, but rather becomes woman" (Beauvoir, 1973, p.301); the views of feminists opposing the patriarchal order overlapped with the arguments of the radical feminist movement. By not accepting any idea that masculine domination is related to, radical feminists associate the subordinate position of women with being a mere "woman". They rejected the institution of marriage and offered alternatives such as artificial insemination and arranged marriages instead (Donovan, 2016). The most important contribution of the Second Wave Feminism to the general feminist movement is that it emphasizes the phenomenon of multiple femininity instead of a one and only single woman (Görgün Baran, 2021).

Emerged with 1990s and being accepted to last until 2010, the Third Wave Feminism was mostly influenced by post-structuralist and post-modernist feminist approaches. It is the co-existence of many feminist currents, and influenced contemporary feminist movements (Krolokke and Sorensen, 2006). It refers to concurrent forms and ways of oppressions such as political, economic, sexual, class and racial differences, and focuses on intersectionality (Walters, 2009, p.162). It argues that the phenomenon of "gender" should be the main and entry point of feminism, and it leans towards individual liberation with micropolitical initiatives, contrary to the "personal is political" slogan of the the Second Wave (Görgün Baran, 2021).

Despite the fact that there are still some arguments regarding that digital era has led to the Fourth Wave of feminism, there are also some who believe digital media do not bring automatically a new era (Bromley, 2012; Korn and Kneese, 2015). In this present study, it is regarded that the Fourth Wave Feminism is the continuation of the Third Wave, and it turns to online feminist movements brought about by technological developments, the Internet, and digitalization (Candemir, 2020, pp. 161-162). This wave, which has been going on since 2010, can also be called "digital sisterhood" (Redfern and Aune, 2010; Fotopoulou, 2016), digital/techno feminism, network feminism, cyber feminism, virtual feminism, and e-feminism.

To clarify, feminists dealing with the issues such as the female body (plus-size), reproductive justice, intersectionality, and male feminism (Waling, 2017),

oppose gender discrimination and the subordination of women simultaneously with the spread of the Internet, which is brought about by social change and can be accepted as a catalyst in this context. These feminist activists bring the challenge of their opposition online by transferring the micropolitical spaces of the Third Wave through advertisements, movies, and other media tools. They contribute to the dissemination of feminism and women's rights activism, with the advantages of low cost and widespread transportation network, by continuing their struggles through platforms such as Twitter, Facebook, Instagram, YouTube, blogs, websites, and with digital publications, books, campaigns, etc. (Adichie 2018). Thus, women fight the patriarchal system both online and offline through activities such as digital content production, organizing volunteers, offline training, public speaking, blogging, designing websites, interfaces, and applications for their campaigns (Mendes et al., 2019). These digital activist movements, which are seen in the literature as "digital activism, activism 2.0, participatory activism, advocacy activism, hashtag activism" (Yang, 2016), can be presented as an example of "Digital Feminist Transformation" in this sense (Koç, 2021, p. 2). There are hundreds of formations and organizations such as MeToo -BenDe-, HeForShe, Everyday Feminism, Feminizing and Jezebel, which have been carrying out their activities worldwide since 2010 and which can be assumed as just some of the reflections of the feminist movement in the digital environment.

FEMINIST MOVEMENT IN TURKEY

The traces of the global feminist movement summarized above, which rooted in Europe and America and spread to other parts of the world, have shown and are showing their effect in Turkey starting from the Ottoman Empire.

According to Tekeli (1998), with the innovation movements in the 19th century, Ottoman women's right to vote and to be elected at the local level in 1930 and at the general level in 1934 corresponds to the First Wave Feminism that developed in the West. With the Constitutional Reform movements in 1876, women began to gain some limited but significant social rights (Kurnaz, 2015). In 1914, five women started to work in the Telephone Administration and entered the public sphere, and since then, women worked in different fields with the First World War and so on (Bora, 2017). Within this period, with the establishment of the Republic, women were seen as the "actor of the return to Western civilization" (Çaha, 2010) and all the innovative movements put women to their center. It is also claimed that women are liberated, not only emancipated, as the patriarchal and traditional system was the basis of the reforms made with the new management

style (Kandiyoti, 1987). Nevertheless, it is accepted that Turkish women achieved the most important leap in their history with all these revolutionary innovations in this period (Tekeli, 2017; Göksel 1992; Acar and Altunok, 2012).

The Second Wave Feminist movement in Turkey is said to find its place after the 1970s, which is a later date than that of the West. 70s was an environment where the division of labor based on gender discrimination; institutions such as family and religion were questioned, and the female body and violence against women were criticized (Tekeli, 1998). Similarly, Gürkan (2021) and Çaha (2001), taking the post-80s as a threshold for Turkish women, draw attention to this periodical distinction.

Undoubtedly, the developments for women's status finding a voice may be CEDAW's (Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women) entering into force in Turkey in 1986. In pursuit of this activation, Duygu Asena published her cult work "Woman Has No Name2" in 1988, The Women's Solidarity Association was established in 1989. Moreover, the 1st Women's Congress was convened and the Family Research Board affiliated to the Prime Ministry of the Republic of Turkey was established (Durakbaşa, 2011). Saktanber (1995) talks about the existence of the programs that started to be broadcast on Turkish television in this period, adapting to modern society life, and in which the motif of mother and wife, which the society sees as ideal, are processed. Sancar (2014) describes this situation as "family-oriented modernization".

Koç (2021) also characterizes these developments in the women's movement in the 1990s as the Third Wave Feminist movements in Turkey. First of all, the issue of women was brought to the agenda of the government with the institution the General Directorate of the Status of Women. However, after 1991, it could not remain the same due to the fact that the government distanced itself from the issue of women (Bora, 2016). The actions such as Tansu Çiller's being elected the first female prime minister of Turkey and women's studies being moved to an academic platform and started to be taught as a discipline in the universities all took place in this period of time.

In the new millennium, the main subjects of feminism in Turkey were women's right to live, the need to keep women and men equal in law, and the movements of non-governmental organizations in the light of the European Union admission process (Berktay, 2004). At the same time, since ethnic women were also focused on with, in the Third Wave, Islamic Feminist discourse emerged from the exclusionary and subordinate tendencies of colonial and orientalist

---

[2]   Its original name in Turkish is "Kadının Adı Yok".

movements against Muslim women (Güç, 2008, p.651). This discourse began to spread in Turkey in the 1980s and later in the early 2000s with the influence of the Islamic bourgeoisie (Dilli and Navarro-Garcia, 2019). As to the Islamic feminist discussions and struggles in Turkey, they focused especially on the problems faced by women who wear headscarves-veiling-, as well as women's access to social life and educational opportunities (Sancar ,2011).

In 2010 and later, with the prevalence of new communication technologies, the Internet, and new media tools, feminist movements in Turkey have progressed in this online way (Altuntaş, 2020). Before the use of the Internet, women were making their voices known in printed documents, at protests, and on the streets, that is, offline. But, without access to such feminist activities, it was impossible to benefit from women's solidarity and knowledge. With the digital age and this digital transformation of feminism, this is made possible (Acar, 2020; Schuster, 2013, p.16). Thus, in addition to femicides in digital feminist platforms in Turkey, feminist issues such as daily sexism, misogynistic discourses produced by Turkish politicians and the media, education, Islamization, headscarf, abortion, women's participation in politics, workers' rights have been started to be discussed (Şener, 2021).

Although limited, the literature review on this subject reveals the transformative feature of the Fourth Wave Feminism within the feminist movement. Şener (2021) articulates that it is possible to combat violence against women especially through social media in Turkey, and adds that with the murder of Özgecan Arslan in 2015, thousands of women shared their sexual abuse situations with the hashtag #sendeanlat on the Twitter platform. She states that the limitations and opportunities that digital media has brought to feminist movements can be analyzed at three levels: visibility, solidarity and awareness raising. However, she also underlines that these opportunities are influenced by some local and global factors that strain the visibility of social movements, such as the limited opportunities for women to access digital media, the limited resources of feminist groups, political repression and the rise of misogyny online. While talking about the increase in research on digital feminist activism in Turkey in recent years, she mentions that these studies are carried out with two approaches such as the analysis of sexist discourses on social media platforms and the analysis of digital feminist media (blogs, websites, social media pages, etc.).

Gedik (2020) remarks that digital feminist activism in Turkey has increased women's awareness of feminism, and on the other hand, the male participants find digital platforms a way to spread male hostility. In particular, she talks about

the instrumentality of digital activism as a means of controlling and preventing femicides. Another name, Gül Ünlü (2021), argues that blogs and websites, which are widely used today and include motherhood roles and responsibilities, can create a digital feminist environment, but also may bring about the opposite situation such as establishing traditional roles of women. She states that instead of transforming gender roles, these platforms can have an effect that will deepen these traditional and patriarchal roles.

Conducting one of the more detailed studies on the blog sites Reçel Blog, Çatlak Zemin and 5Harfliler, Yatkın (2021), indicates that these blogs create a space for feminist activism in Turkey, they do not advocate political goals and do not embody a collective identity. Another name making research on the same blog sites, Göker (2019), marks that websites also serve as a platform where feminist identity, and the past, present and future of feminist politics are discussed in a humorous, agonistic and emotional manner. On their study on the Twitter accounts of the feminist groups such as Mor Çatı, Uçan Süpürge and Üniversiteli Kadın Kolektifi, Şen and Kök (2017), reveals that these groups use social media effectively and as a medium where they can carry out their activities. They also concluded that the topics covered on these accounts are violence against women, abuse, harassment, rape and posts about current politics.

Talking generally, there are 726 women's organizations in Turkey and that all of these organizations contribute to women's movement and feminism by creating their websites and portals (Dalaman, 2020; Karagöz, 2013). Even though it is not possible to cover all of them here, it would not be wrong to say that associations, groups, communities and blogs, platforms, websites and social media accounts created by these groups or created independently are the platforms within the Digital Feminist Movement in Turkey: Çatlak Zemin, Müslüman Anneler Blogu, 5Harfliler, Yalnız Yürümeyeceksin, Dijital Topuklar, 40tilki, Erklotia, Kadına Şiddete karşı Müslüman İnisiyatifi (KŞKMİ), Sen de Anlat Platformu, Kampüs Cadıları, Reçel-Blog, Mor Çatı, Uçan Süpürge, Cinsel Şiddet ile Mücadele Derneği, Kadın Adayları Destekleme Derneği (KA.DER), Kaos-GL Derneği, Bianet (Bağımsız İletişim Ağı), Kadın Cinayetlerini Durduracağız Platformu Derneği, Cinsel Şiddetle Mücadele Derneği, Başkent Kadın Platformu, Hazar Derneği, Kadından Topluma Eğitim Grubu, Kadın ve Demokrasi Derneği (KADEM), Ayrımcılığa Karşı Kadın Hakları Derneği (AK-DER), Eşitlik İzleme Kadın Grubu, Eşitlik, Adalet, Kadın Platformu, Feminist Gündem, Kadın Savunması, Kadınlar Birlikte Güçlü, Mor Dayanışma, Nar Kadın Dayanışması, Üniversiteli Kadın Kolektifi, etc.

Among these, there are some formations and organizations that support Islamic feminist movement whose influence began to be seen in Turkey with the Third Wave Feminist movement and transferred into online platforms with the Fourth Wave (Digital) Feminism.

THE FOURTH WAVE FEMINISM AND THE ISLAMIC FEMINIST MOVEMENT IN TURKEY

Moving from the idea of accepting the Fourth Wave Feminism as the continuation of the Third Wave, The Islamic feminist movement, which has spread in Turkey at the beginning of the 2000s, began to take place in the mass media with digital transformation in 2010 and later. This period can be qualified as the Fourth Wave (Digital) Islamic Feminist Movement in Turkey3.

However, it should also be taken into account that in a country like Turkey, where there are significant social differences between classes and regions, it would be wrong to expect digital transformation and the rise of feminist consciousness to be simultaneous (Koç, 2021, p. 133). Yet in this study, whether they identify themselves as feminists or not, after the spread of Islamic feminism in Turkey in the Third Feminist Wave, digital studies of the feminist activists were accepted and processed as Islamic digital feminist movements.

In a nutshell, Islamic feminism can be defined as the activist movements of Muslim women in the late 90s about the reproduction of the interpretation of Islamic sources and women's demands for rights (Badran, 1995; Moghadam, 2002). These Muslim women intellectuals started off with the idea of rereading Islamic sources through the eyes of women, arguing that the factor that put women in a subordinate position is not the religion of Islam itself, but Arab traditions that influenced Islamic tradition (Tohidi, 2004). They focus on the deconstruction of androcentric interpretations of Islam (Bora, 2017).

Spreading in Turkey in the early 2000s with the influence of the Islamic bourgeoisie, the Islamic feminist movement can be criticized for not having a common manifesto and not having a homogeneous structure. Furthermore, considering the historical process of this movement in Turkey it can be said that a country founded on the Ottoman remnant is in parallel with the institutional and mental transformation of the former entity (Altıparmak and Budak, 2020).

---

3   In this paper, the term "Islamic feminism" is used by looking at the other common usages in the literature; regardless as any political, sociological and ideological thought. Also the term "Islamic Digital Feminism" is chosen by taking basis the article "Weber, B M (2015). "Kübra Gümüşay, Muslim digital feminism and the politics of visuality in Germany". Feminist media Studies. 16 (1): 101-116.

Looking at the process, it can be deduced that Islamic feminism remained at the center of the headscarf debate in Turkey with the February 28 Process4, and continued in this way for a long time. On the other hand, in the countries other than Turkey, Islamic feminism focused on the issues such as the reinterpretation of Islamic sources, inheritance, witnessing, polygamy, and participation in Friday prayers (Altıparmak and Budak, 2020). Whether there has been an axis shift in the subject and struggle form of the Islamic feminist movement in Turkey and in other countries will be discussed at the end of this study.

In this context, in this part of the study, whether they define themselves as feminists or not, the activities of the Islamic digital feminist groups in Turkey such as Reçel Blog, Havle Women's Association, Muslims Against Violence Towards Women and Women in Mosques will be discussed. The relationship between their activities and Islamic feminism will be the latter part of the paper. Meanwhile, it is thought it is useful to state that the founders of these formations were influenced by each other and/or consisted of the same people.

METHODOLOGY

This study is conducted through the paradigms and principles of qualitative research methods, aiming at revealing what the authors want to say in the foreground and background with an in-depth analysis (Strauss and Corbin, 1997). In order to achieve this purpose, the digital accounts of the four Islamic digital feminist groups in Turkey, Reçel Blog, Havle Women's Association, Muslims Against Violence Towards Women and Women in Mosques.

The document analysis technique will be used while collecting the sharings and the messages the social media accounts of these entities. The messages of these entities will be analyzed through content analysis strategy, a scientific approach that investigates social reality by objectively and systematically classifying, and/or inferring the message contained in verbal, written and other materials in terms of meaning and/or grammar (Miles et al., 2015).

FINDINGS

In order to achieve to the aims of the study, to tease out the Islamic digital feminist activism in Turkey and analyze whether there is an axis shift in the subject and struggle form of the Islamic feminist movement, Akan and Gürhan's (2020) categories, "the issues of struggle" and "the form of struggle", will be used.

4   Refers to the date, 28 February 1997, when the generals submitted their views on issues regarding secularism and political Islam on Turkey to the government during the National Security Council meeting.

REÇEL BLOG[5]

The blog site was established in 2014 and was named after Dücane Cündioğlu's discourse of "Islamic women who cannot make jam" -Reçel means jam in Turkish- referring to the fact that Muslim women have moved away from tradition and family life as a result of modernization (Akyılmaz, 2015, p. 118). Feyza Akınerdem, Rümeysa Çamdereli and Meryem Selva, the founders and the editors of the blog site, say that the purpose for the establishment of the site is to share the issues on women through online articles. They state that "As women, and especially Muslim women, we wanted to have a channel where we can talk about our daily experiences, our perception of social issues, our interests, curiosities, troubles, hopes, concerns and struggles".6

The articles shared on the blog site are of the topics such as violence against women, women's education, Islam and feminism, headscarves, women in academia, honor, women and music, women's participation in social life, masculinity, marriage life and women, women going to mosques, etc.

HAVLE WOMEN'S ASSOCIATION

Established at the end of 2018, the association defines itself as "the first Muslim feminist women association of Turkey". They run their activities through social media tools such as Facebook, Instagram, Wordpress, Twitter and Linktree. They share their aims with these words: "WHO ARE WE? -BİZ KİMİZ?- Havle Women's Association was established with the aim of identifying and combating the difficulties and obstacles that women, and especially women who define themselves as Muslim, face in all areas of life. In line with this purpose, the theoretical and practical approaches/solutions will feed by the accumulation of feminism and women's movements and will contribute to this accumulation."7

The founders of the association also predicate that they want to increase the involvement of Muslim women to feminism, and we believe that this can be achieved with two steps: By addressing the unique problems of Muslim women, such as discriminatory expressions and approaches towards women with headscarves, and the problems women experience in mosques. Secondly, shaking the alleged Islamic grounds, where problems such as early and forced marriages are nurtured (Meryem, 2019).

---

[5]   The social media accounts of the blog are available at http://recel-blog.com/ , https://www.facebook.com/ recelblogcom/about/ , http://recel-blog.com/ , https://twitter.com/recelblog

[6]   http://recel-blog.com/recel/

[7]   https://www.facebook.com/havlekadin/

They held two conferences, first of which was in Istanbul, on November 23-24, 2019, "Muslim Feminists Tell Their Stories"; second was online on December 19-20, 2020, with the title "The Localization of Feminism". They deal with many issues such as early marriages, Istanbul Convention, violence against women, child abuse, Islamic family law, female body and sexuality, alimony right, women's place in public and private spheres, with events such as talks, conferences, workshops, workshops, marches, and iftar meals. In addition, they help students and academics who carry out studies such as graduation homework and thesis in the academic field.8

MUSLIMS AGAINST VIOLENCE TOWARDS WOMEN (MAVTW)[9]

MAVTW -Kadına Şiddete Karşı Müslümanlar İnisiyatifi, KŞKMİ- was founded in Istanbul in 2013. On the website of the group, there is a lot of information such as fighting against violence, what to do and where to apply in case of violence, legal rights and responsibilities. The members of the group call for women's solidarity against violence.

According to the founders of the group, "MAVTW consists of women who believe that women are created equal with men. We, as Muslim women, who oppose masculinity as a means of oppression and violence on women by turning into a power identity, aim to fight against the inequality, discrimination, and violence that women suffer just because they are women"10.

The group continues their activities via interviews, readings (publications on Islamic feminism and readings), conferences, workshops, walks, and iftar dinners.

WOMEN IN MOSQUES[11]

The campaign Women in Wosques -Kadınlar Camilerde- was started in 2017 in order to make women meet in mosques to discuss what to do on behalf of the women's movement. Every Friday at 18:30, they meet at Üsküdar Mihrimah Sultan Mosque. They Express their goals as: "to pave the way for women to participate

---

8   The social media accounts of the entity are available at https://havlekadin.wordpress.com/ , https://www.facebook.com/havlekadin/ , https://www.instagram.com/havlekadin/?hl=tr , https://twitter.com/HavleKadin?ref_src=twsrc%5Egoogle%7Ctwcamp%5Eserp%7Ctwgr%5Eauthor , https://linktr.ee/havle

9   The social media accounts of the entity are available at https://www.facebook.com/KadinaSiddeteKarsiMuslumanlar/ , https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCUBKi-91u80b-bXJE8koWWw , https://kskmi.wordpress.com/

10   Neyi Amaçladık? https://kskmi.wordpress.com/

11   The social media accounts of the entity are available at http://kadinlarcamilerde.com/ , https://twitter.com/kadinlarcamiler , https://www.instagram.com/kadinlarcamilerde/?hl=tr , https://www.facebook.com/kadinlarcamilerde/

more effectively in the mosque community and to activate the mechanisms responsible for the arrangement of mosques in line with these demands"12

While women started the campaign with meetings to improve their position in mosques, their aim eventually turned into discussing the problems women faced at Friday prayers. In addition, the blog on the organization's website contains articles on various topics.

CONCLUSION

The use of ICT With the spread and development of feminism, there have occured some periodic conceptualizations used to distinguish policies followed by women in feminist struggle. The Third Wave Feminism, one of these periods, emphasizes that women's lives are intersectional by prioritizing differences such as race, class, gender, ethnicity, religion, etc. Centering the religious voices in an intersectional context, Islamic feminism, emerged within this period and dealt with the exclusionary and subordinating tendencies of colonial and orientalist movements against Muslim women, began to spread in Turkey after the 2000s. The Fourth Wave (Digital) Feminism, which is described as a continuation of the Third Wave with the use of digital technologies and new media tools in the online environment, plays a leading role in reaching a wider audience of women's movement.

The frequent use of the Internet and social networks with globalization has revealed that social movements, including the feminist movement, have gained a new dimension and opened a new field for their activism. Women are now contributing to the feminist transformation by taking action only through social media accounts and online ways, without taking to the streets or other offline platforms.

Taking the Fourth Wave Feminism, which is also called digital/techno-feminism, digital sisterhood, network feminism, and cyber-feminism; and its historical process, this wave, which has been going on since 2010, can also be defined as "the transfer of the Third Wave Feminist movement to the online digital environment via the Internet" by some theorists and also in this study. By writing blogs, using social media accounts, organizing campaigns, following women's activism with speeches, trainings and many other online activities, women activists reveal the intersectionality dimension of feminism with different femininity issues.

---

12   Kadınlar Camilerde Neyi Hedefliyor? http://kadinlarcamilerde.com/neyi-hedefliyoruz/

Among these different femininities, the Islamic feminist movement, which was formed by the colonial and orientalist movements questioning the positions of Muslim women in the Third Wave, started to take place on the feminist agenda in Turkey in the early 2000s with the influence of the Islamic bourgeoisie. With the spread of the Internet, Islamic feminists brought their activism online. In the context of Turkey, especially the headscarf problem, women's participation in social life and the right to education are clustered as the activations within Islamic feminism.

In line with the purpose of this study, four Islamic feminist groups in Turkey such as Reçel Blog, Havle Women's Association, Muslims Against Violence Towards Women and Women in Mosques are taken as the samples on this research.

Analyzes of the online tools used by these entities reveal that all four formations shed light on the possibility of a feminism that includes differences by articulating different experiences of womanhood, based on the "intersectionality" principle of feminism. The fact that the founders of these formations are influenced by each other and/or consist of the same people can be presented as an example to this situation. In addition, the online accounts of all four organizations' referring to each other's work as well as the work of secular feminist groups that undertake the struggle of different femininity subjects, constitute an instance of the "intersectionality" principle of feminism.

For example, on September 27, 2017, MAVTW shared the article of Çatlak Zemin (a secular feminist group) titled "Saudi Women Don't Recognize Driving Ban" dated June 17, 201113. Similarly, their calling women to activism with a title "As women who say, "I can be both a Muslim and a feminist," we are at the Feminist Night March this year as well!" on March 7, 2018, can be shown as an indication that the groups are in contact with each other as a matter of intersectionality14.

Another point is whether these formations define themselves as feminists or not. Yavuz-Özinanır (2016) states that there are also those who call them as feminists within MAVTW, which can be regarded as one of the examples of the new generation of digital Muslim activists that has developed since the 2010s.

However, there are those who are distant from feminism. On the other hand, the fact that these organizations recognize feminism's "consciousness-raising" mission, may allow themselves to be considered as feminists. For instance, MAVTW starts a struggle based on the absence of violence against women in Islam and talks about the start of a struggle to raise awareness in society in this

---

[13]   https://www.facebook.com/KadinaSiddeteKarsiMuslumanlar/

[14]   https://www.facebook.com/KadinaSiddeteKarsiMuslumanlar/

context (T24, 2015). Emphasizing the activist achievements of such pro-feminist women's websites in Turkey as a source of inspiration and criticism, Göker (2019), indicates that they create important projects in feminist memory studies, archiving misogynistic and patriarchal policies with feminist achievements.

In a more neutral expression, given their relevance to Islamic feminism, Dalaman (2020, p.227) describes these formations as "second generation Muslim feminists". Considering the two categories, "the issues of struggle" and "the form of struggle", that Akan and Gürhan (2020), used while revealing their similarities and differences with feminism, the following interpretations can be reached for these formations:

• Within the Fourth Wave Feminist movement in Turkey, Reçel Blog, Havle Women's Association, Muslims Against Violence Towards Women and Women in Mosques, focused on women's access to education opportunities, especially with the problems experienced by women who wear headscarves within the first periods of their establishment. However, over time, these formations started todeal with issues such as violence, equality, ethnicity, public and private spheres, which are also discussed by Islamic feminists in other parts of the World. In short, the difference between the issues discussed by Islamic feminists in Turkey and outside Turkey began to close.

• Even three of these groups, Reçel Blog, Havle Women's Association and MAVTW, go one step further and criticize the headscarf debates as they are still held despite the success of the previous generations as a result of their struggles. In addition, the fact that the right to abortion, the right to divorce, early and forced marriage, domestic violence, Queer theory and LGBT rights -although limited- are on the agenda of these organizations; are seen significant both because overlapping intersections with Muslim female identity (Dalaman, 2020) as well as following the reflections of Islamic feminism in the world.

• Another point that coincides with the Islamic feminist movement in the world is that on the one hand, they criticize Islam in the context of patriarchy and tradition, on the other hand, they have reduced the notion of motherhood from a sacred point to a daily dimension by deconstructing it. Highlighting this point, Gezer Tuğrul (2018, p.82) expresses that the writers of the Reçel Blog have a feminist stance with the following words: "Determining themselves as educated, working, religious/Muslim women who advocate for women's rights, it is possible to see on the Reçel Blog that they try to to put forward a stance against traditional femininity and motherhood.". Furthermore, as

MAVTW arranges some translation readings can be presented as an example of Islamic feminism. By looking at these situations, they can be regarded as Islamic feminists considering their issues of struggle.

- As to their form of struggle, it can be said that these formations are also like the Islamic feminist movement in other parts of the world. As an instance, Sisters in Islam in Malaysia, MUSAWAH movement, WLUML, etc. now carry out their struggles online, and actualize many activities such as conferences, interviews, workshops, and online trainings. At this point, it can be commented that the forms of struggle of Reçel Blog, Havle Women's Association and MAVTW go together with digital activism and therefore with the Fourth Wave feminist movement. On the other hand, the form of struggle of women in Mosques only continues the internet at the blog point. Due to the pandemic, gatherings in mosques continue with limited opportunities.

Based on all this information and these examples, it can be concluded that the Islamic digital feminist movement in Turkey follows the feminist transformation in other parts of the World in terms of both the issues of struggle and the form of struggle.

REFERENCES

Acar. E. (2020). *Collective identity in feminist alternative new media: The case of 5harfliler. com.* Yüksek lisans tezi, Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Ankara.

Acar, F. & Altunok, G. (2012). *Toplumsal cinsiyet eşitliği taleplerini anlamak: türkiye'de kadın hareketinin temelleri ve sınırları.* In *Türkiye'de refah devleti ve kadın.* Edited by Dedeoğlu S. and Elveren A. Y., 71-101. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Adichie, N. (2018). *Feminist manifesto.* İstanbul: Doğan Kitabevi.

Akan, E and Gürhan, N. (2020). Feminizmin "e- hali: Dijital feminizm üzerine bir araştırma. *HAFIZA Uluslararası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi.* 2 (2), 4-22.

Akyılmaz, Ö. (2015). *Türkiye'deki bloglarda İslami-feminist yaklaşımla yeni bir kadın kimliğinin inşası (reçel blog örneği).* Yüksek lisans tezi, Gaziantep Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü. Gaziantep.

Altıparmak, Ş. & Budak, H. (2020). İslami feminizm ve Türkiye'deki yansımaları. *Karatay Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi.* 4, 21-41.

Altuntaş, B. (2020). *Dijital çağda çevrimiçi feminist aktivizm üzerine bir araştırma.* Yüksek lisans tezi, Ege Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İzmir.

Badran, M. (1995). *Feminists, Islam and nation: Gender and the making of modern Egypt.* New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Baumgardner, J. (2011). *f'em!: goo goo, gaga and some thoughts on balls.* Berkeley, CA: Seal Press.

Berktay, F. (2004). Kadınların insan haklarının gelişimi ve türkiye. *Sivil Toplum ve Demokrasi Konferans Yazıları.* 7-1.

Bora, A. (2016). *Bir yapılabilirlik olarak Ka-Der.* In *90'larda Türkiye'de feminizm*, Edited by Bora, A and Günal A, İletişim Yayınları, İstanbul.

Bora, T. (2017). *Cereyanlar*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Bromley, V. (2012). *Feminisms matter: debates, theories, activism*. Canada: University of Toronto Press.

Candemir, D. M. (2020). *2000'lerde feminizm: Türkiye'de feminist hareketler ve dijital aktivizm. Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce, Feminizm*, Edited by Tanıl Bora, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Çaha, Ö. (2001). *Türkiye'de kadın hareketi tarihi: Değişen bir şey var mı?.* in *kadın bienali etkinlikleri çerçevesinde türkiye'de kadın ve sivil toplum,* İstanbul. Available at: https://kadem.org.tr/turkiyede-kadin-hareketinin-tarihi-degisen-bir-sey-varmi/ (accessed 12 Sep 2023)

Çaha, Ö. (2010). *Sivil kadın, Türkiye'de kadın ve sivil toplum*. Ankara: Savaş Yayınevi.

Çakır, S. (2014). Feminizm: Ataerkil iktidarın eleştirisi. In *19. Yüzyıldan 20. yüzyıla modern siyasal ideolojiler*, Edited by H. B. Örs, İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Dalaman, Z. B. (2020). *Kadın Hareketinde feminist alternatif medyanın rolü: Türkiye ve Tunus örnekleri*. Doktora tezi, İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İstanbul.

De Beauvoir, S. (1993). *İkinci cins*. İstanbul: Payel Yayınevi.

Dilli, Ş & Navarro Garcia, L. (2019). Avrupa'da göç, yoksulluk, dışlanma ve İslâmî feminizm. *Turkish Studies*, 14 (3), 1371-1390.

Donovan, J. (2016). *Feminist teori*, Aksu Bora vd. (Trans.). İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

DuBois, E. C. (1997). *Harriot Stanton Blatch and the winning of woman suffrage*. New Haven; Yale University Press.

Durakbaşa, A. (2011). Toplumsal cinsiyet sosyolojisine başlangıç. In: *Toplumsal cinsiyet sosyolojisi.* Edited by Ecevit Y and Karkıner N, , Eskişehir: Anadolu Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Fotopoulou, A. (2016). Digital and networked by default? Women's organisations and the social imaginary of networked feminism. *New Media & Society*, 18 (6), 989-1005.

Freedman, E. B. (2002). *No turning back: The history of feminism and the future of women*. London. Profile Books.

Gedik, E. (2020). Dünyada ve Türkiye'de dijital feminizm incelemesi: gençlerin dijital aktivizm deneyimleri. *Toplum ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi*. 5, 123-36.

Gezer-Tuğrul, Y. (2018). Dindar kadınların annelik algısı: Reçel blog ve Müslüman anneler blogunun karşılaştırmalı analizi. *Fe Dergi* 10 (2), 71-84.

Göker, Z. G. (2019). Memories, stories and deliberation: Digital sisterhood on feminist websites in Turkey. *European Journal of Women's Studies*. 26 (3), 313-328.

Göksel, B. (1984). Atatürk ve kadın hakları. *Atatürk Araştırma Merkezi Dergisi,* 1(1), 213-235.

Görgün Baran, A. (2021). Feminizmin gelişim serüveni: Dalga yerine kuşak diyelim mi? (2021, January 31). Available at: https://kockam.ku.edu.tr/feminizmin-gelisim-seruveni-dalga-yerine-kusak-diyelim-mi-aylin-gorgun-baran/ (accessed 12 May 2022).

Güç, A. (2008). İslamcı feminizm: Müslüman kadınların birey olma çabaları. *Uludağ Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*. 17 (2), 649-673.

Gül Ünlü, D. (2021). Dijital annelerin feminist sesi: annelik inşasının tartışmaya açılmasında web siteleri ve blog içeriklerinin rolü. *Erciyes İletişim Dergisi.* 8 (1), 421-440.

Gürkan, S. (2021). *Türkiye'de İslam ilmihallerine toplumsal cinsiyet algısındaki değişim çerçevesinde sosyolojik yaklaşım.* Doktora tezi, Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi Lisansüstü Eğitim Enstitüsü, Samsun.

Kandiyoti, D. (1987). Emancipated but unliberated? Reflection on the Turkish case. *Feminist Studies.* 13 (2), 317-338.

Karagöz, K. (2013). Yeni medya çağında dönüşen toplumsal hareketler ve dijital aktivizm hareketleri. *İletişim ve Diplomasi,* 1, 131-157.

Koç, E. İ. (2021). *Dijital teknoloji/ kültür ve feminizm bağlamında sosyal ağlarda kadın sorununun temsili: Twitter üzerine bir inceleme.* Yüksek lisans tezi, Ege Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İzmir.

Kolay, H. (2015). Kadın hareketinin süreçleri, talepleri ve kazanımları. *Emo Kadın Bülteni*, 3, 5-11.

Korn, J. U. & Kneese, T. (2015). Guest Editors' introduction: feminist approaches to social media research: History, activism, and values, *Feminist Media Studies*, 15 (4), 707-710, DOI: 10.1080/14680777.2015.1053713.

Kroløkke, C. & Sørensen, A. S. (2006). Gender communication theories and analyses: from silence to performance. Thousand Oaks, SAGE Publications, CA.

Kurnaz, Ş. (2015). *Yenileşme sürecinde türk kadını 1839-1923.* Ankara: Ötüken Yayınları.

Mendes, K., Ringrose, J. & Keller, J. (2019). *Digital feminist activism. girls and women fight back against rape culture*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Meryem, D. (2019). Türkiye'de ilk Müslüman feminist kadın derneği: Havle. *Sivil Sayfalar*, Available at: https://www.sivilsayfalar.org/2019/04/02/turkiyede-ilk-musluman-feminist-kadin-dernegi-havle/ (accessed 16 November 2022)

Miles, M. B. & Huberman, M, A. (2015). *Qualitative data analysis-a methods sourcebook.* USA: Sage Publications.

Moghadam, V. M. (2002). Islamic Feminism and its discontents: Toward a resolution of the debate. *Journal of Women in Culture and Society*. 27 (4), 1135-1171.

Redfern, C. & Aune, K. (2010). *Baş harfi f.* Aksu Bora and Simten Coşar (Trans.). Ayizi, İstanbul.

Saktanber, A. (1995). Türkiye'de medyada kadın: Serbest, müsait kadın veya iyi eş, fedakâr; Anne. In *Kadın bakış açısından 1980'ler Türkiye'sinde kadınlar*. Edited by Tekeli Ş., İletişim Yayınları, İstanbul.

Sancar, S. (2014). *Türk modernleşmesinin cinsiyeti erkekler devlet, kadınlar aile kurar.* İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.

Sancar, S. (2011). Türkiye'de kadın hareketinin politiği: Tarihsel bağlam, politik gündem ve özgünlükler. In *Birkaç arpa boyu: 21. yüzyıla girerken türkiye'de feminist çalışmalar*, Edited by Sancar, Koç Üniversitesi Yayınları, İstanbul.

Schuster, J. (2013). Invisible feminists? Social media and young women's political participation. *Political Science*, 65(1), 8-24.

Strauss, A and Corbin, J. (1997). *Grounded theory in practice.* Thousand Oaks, Sage Publications, CA.

Şen, F. & Kök, H. (2017). Sosyal medya ve feminist aktivizm: türkiye'deki feminist grupların aktivizm biçimleri. *Atatürk İletişim Dergisi*, 13, 73-86.

Şener, G. (2021). *Digital feminist activism in Turkey.* London School of Economics and Political Science by Media@LSE Working Paper Series. London.

T24. (2015). Kadına karşı şiddete karşı Müslümanlar inisiyatifi: Bizim mahalleden ses yok! .(10 March 2015) Available at: https://t24.com.tr/haber/kadina-siddete-karsimuslumanlar-inisiyatifi-bizim-mahalleden-ses-yok,289980 (accssed 3 August 2022)

Tekeli, Ş. (1998). Birinci ve ikinci dalga feminist hareketlerin karşılaştırmalı incelemesi. In: *75 yılda kadınlar ve erkekler*, Edited by Hacımirzaoğlu, A. B., İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları.

Tekeli, Ş. (2017). *Feminizmi düşünmek.* İ İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Tohidi, N. (2004). İslami feminizm- tehlikeler ve Ümit vaad eden unsurları. İhsan Toker (Çev.). *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*. 45 (2), 279-289.

Waling, A. (2017). Men and fourth-wave feminism: Acceptance, ambivalence, resistance. *New Community,* 14 (56), 34-37.

Walters, M. (2009). *Feminizm.* İstanbul: Dost Ev.

Yang, G. (2016). Narrative agency in hashtag activism: The case of #Blacklivesmatter. *Media and Communication*, 4 (4), 13-17.

Yatkın, I. (2021). *(Re)drawing the map of politics: Practising feminist blog writing as a political mode of engagement.* Master's thesis, Central European University Department of International Relations, Vienna.

Yavuz Özinanır, S. (2016). Kadın perspektifli bir İslami yorumlama biçimi olarak kadına şiddete karşı müslümanlar inisiyatifi. *Fe Dergi* 8 (1), 118-130.