

# Anne Olumsuzluğu ve Çocuklara Kötü Muamele

Evrimsel Perspektifler Katmanlı ve Şefkatli Bir Anlayışa Nasıl Katkı Sağlar?

Daniela F. Sieff<sup>1</sup>

Çeviri: Özge ULUSOY CULHA\*

## Özet

Batı kültüründe, hem ruh sağlığı uzmanları hem de sıradan halk, annelerin tüm çocuklarını içgüdüsel ve koşulsuz olarak sevmek üzere evrimleştiğine inanma eğilimindedir. Buna karşılık, çocuğuna karşı kararsız veya düşmanca duygular besleyen herhangi bir anne tipik olarak doğal görülmez ve çocuğuna kötü davranan bir anne, patolojik davranışlar sergiliyor olarak görülür. Bu bölüm, anneliğe ilişkin bu yaygın görüşe meydan okumak için evrimsel araştırmalardan yararlanmaktadır. Özellikle, annelerin çocuk yetiştirirken bir dizi karmaşık, güvencesiz ve katmanlı ödünü nasıl müzakere etmesi gerektiğini aydınlatır, anne olumsuzluğunun ve çocuklara kötü muamelenin bundan nasıl kaynaklanabileceğini gösterir.

Bu bölümün amacı, evrimsel olarak daha geçerli, detaylı ve şefkatli bir annelik anlayışı geliştirmektir. Böyle bir anlayış, bocalayan annelerle ilgili klinik çalışmalara ve annelerin çocuklara kötü muamele etmesini önlemeye odaklanan programlara katkıda bulunma potansiyeline sahiptir.

## Anahtar kelimeler

çocuk istismarı, çocuklara kötü muamele, çocuk ihmali, evrimsel psikiyatri, evrimsel ödünleşim, bebek öldürme, anne düşmanlığı, anne kötü muamelesi, anne olumsuzluğu

## Anahtar Noktalar

- Anneler, çocuklarının her biri için otomatik ve koşulsuz sevgi hissedecek şekilde evrimleşmiştir. Bunun yerine evrim annelere tam bir bağlılıktan olumsuzluğa kadar uzanan bir spektrum gösteren annelik duyguları vermiştir. Bir kadının bu süreçte konumlandığı yer, içinde bulunduğu koşullardan etkilenir. Çocuk yetiştirmesini desteklemek için toplayabildiği kaynaklar ve çocuğunun nitelikleri özellikle önemlidir.

- Annenin davranışı, çok sevilen bir çocuğu grup normlarına uydurma ihtiyacından kaynaklanabilir. Evrim tarihi boyunca bir grubun parçası olmak hayatta kalmak için çok önemlidir.
- Anne davranışı, sosyal öğrenme ile şekillenerek evrimleşmiştir. Kız çocuklar, bilinçli bir çaba ve niyet olmaksızın kendi çocukluklarında yaşadıkları ve gözlemledikleri aracılığıyla anneliği öğrenirler. Kötü muamelenin nesiller boyunca aktarılması, genellikle bunun olumsuz bir sonucudur.
- Bazı anne olumsuzluklarının ve çocuklara kötü muamelenin evrimleşmiş etkilerden kaynaklandığı gerçeği, onu daha az zararlı yapmaz. Anne olumsuzluğu ve çocuklara kötü muamele, kökenleri ne olursa olsun, son derece zarar vericidir. Duygusal travmayı (kompleks travma sonrası stres bozukluğu olarak da bilinir) körüklerler,

<sup>1</sup> Önceki taslaklarla ilgili düşünceli yorumları için Sarah Blaffer Hrdy, Dan Delli, Aaron Denham, Louise Holland, Bruce Lloyd ve Pablo Nepomnaschy'ye minnettarım. Bu konudaki konuşmalarımı takip eden tartışmalara katkıda bulunanlara da minnettarım. Bu bölüm, bu katkılarla daha iyidir, ancak nihai sorumluluk bana aittir.

\* Dr., Çukurova Üniversitesi Tıp Fakültesi Ruh Sağlığı ve Hastalıkları AD., oculha@cu.edu.tr

haklı veya kaçınılmaz olduğunu varsaymaya 'natüralist yanılığ' denir. Hiç kimse, insanlığın varoluşunun çoğunu karakterize eden yüksek çocuk ölüm oranlarına katlanmamız gerektiğini ve bunun kaderimiz olduğunu iddia etmez. Bununla birlikte, çocuk ölümlerini azaltmak için hastalık vektörlerini, sanitasyonları ve

beslenmeyi anlamamız gerektiği gibi, anne olumsuzluğunu ve çocuklara kötü muameleyi harekete geçiren faktörleri de bu durumu daha iyi ele almak için anlamamız gerekir. Evrimsel bakış açıları bu anlayışa önemli bir katkı sunabilir.

## Kaynaklar

- Abu-Saad, K. and Fraser, D. 2010. Maternal nutrition and birth outcomes. *Epidemiologic Reviews*, 32, 5–25.
- Alami, S., Von Rueden, C., Seabright, E., Kraft, T. S., Blackwell, A. D., Stieglitz, J., Kaplan, H. and Gurven, M. 2020. Mother's social status is associated with child health in a horticulturalist population. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 287, 20192783.
- Apicella, C. L. and Silk, J. B. 2019. The evolution of human cooperation. *Current Biology*, 29, R447–R450.
- Assink, M., Spruit, A., Schuts, M., Lindauer, R., Van Der Put, C. E. and Stams, G. J. M. 2018. The intergenerational transmission of child maltreatment: a three-level meta-analysis. *Child Abuse and Neglect*, 84, 131–145.
- Atari, M. 2020. Culture of honor. In: V. Zeigler-Hill and T. K. Shackelford, (eds.), *Encyclopedia of Personality and Individual Differences*. Cham: Springer International Publishing, pp. 977–981.
- Baek, S. U., Lim, S. S., Kim, J. and Yoon, J. H. 2019. How does economic inequality affect infanticide rates? An analysis of 15 years of death records and representative economic data. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 16, 3679.
- Bakermans-Kranenburg, M. J., Van Ijzendoorn, M. H. and Kroonenberg, P. M. 2004. Differences in attachment security between African- American and white children: ethnicity or socio-economic status? *Infant Behavior and Development*, 27, 417–433.
- Barrett, L., Dunbar, R. and Lycett, J. 2002. *Human Evolutionary Psychology*. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Black, R. E., Allen, L. H., Bhutta, Z. A., Caulfield, L. E., De Onis, M., Ezzati, M., Mathers, C. and Rivera, J. 2008. Maternal and child undernutrition: global and regional exposures and health consequences. *Lancet*, 371, 243–260.
- Boehm, C. 2012. *Moral Origins: The Evolution of Virtue, Altruism and Shame*. New York: Basic Books.
- Bowlby, E. J. M. 1969/1997. *Attachment and Loss: Attachment*. London: Pimlico.
- Boyd, R. and Richerson, P. J. 2009. Culture and the evolution of human cooperation. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 364, 3281–3288.
- Bradshaw, J. 1988. *Healing the Shame That Binds You*. Deerfield Beach, FL: Health Communications, Inc.
- Bridges, R. S. (ed.) 2008. *Neurobiology of the Parental Brain*. Amsterdam: Elsevier.
- Brown, L. S. 2011. Nutritional requirements during pregnancy. In: J. Sharlin, and S. Edelstein (eds.), *Essentials of Life Cycle Nutrition*. Ontario: Jones and Bartlett Publishers, pp. 1–24.
- Chamberlain, G. 2017. Why climate change is creating a new generation of child brides. *The Observer*, 26 November.
- Coleman-Jensen, A., Rabbitt, M. P., Gregory, C. A. and Anita Singh, A. 2018. *Household Food Security in the United States in 2017*. Washington, DC: United States Department of Agriculture, Economic Research Service.
- Crookston, B. T., Dearden, K. A., Alder, S. C., Porucznik, C. A., Stanford, J. B., Merrill, R. M., Dickerson, T. T. and Penny, M. E. 2011. Impact of early and concurrent stunting on cognition. *Maternal & Child Nutrition*, 7, 397–409.
- Cuarteras, J., Weissman, D. G., Sheridan, M. A., Lengua, L. and McLaughlin, K. A. 2021. Corporal punishment and elevated neural response to threat in children. *Child Development*, 92, 821–832.
- De Vries, M. W. 1987. Cry babies, culture and catastrophe: infant temperament among the Masai. In: N. Scheper-Hughes (ed.), *Child Survival: Anthropological Perspectives on the Treatment and Maltreatment of Children*. Dordrecht: D. Reidel Publishing Company, pp. 165–185.
- Denham, A. R. 2017. *Spirit Children: Illness, Poverty, and Infanticide in Northern Ghana*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.
- Dettwyler, K. A. 1994. *Dancing Skeletons: Life and Death in West Africa*. Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.
- Dion, J., Paquette, G., Tremblay, K.-N., Collin-Vézina, D. and Chabot, M. 2018. Child maltreatment among children with intellectual disability in the Canadian Incidence Study. *American Journal on Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities*, 123,

- 176–188.
- Drixler, F. 2013. *Mabiki: Infanticide and Population Growth in Eastern Japan, 1660–1950*. Berkley: University of California Press.
- Gabler, S. and Volland, E. 1994. Fitness of twinning. *Human Biology*, 66, 699–713.
- Gurven, M. and Kaplan, H. 2007.
- Longevity among hunter-gatherers: a cross-cultural examination. *Population and Development Review*, 33, 321–365.
- Hawkes, K., O’Connell, J. F. and Blurton Jones, N. 1989.
- Hardworking Hadza grandmothers. In: V. Standen and R. A. Foley (eds.), *Comparative Socioecology: The Behavioural Ecology of Humans and Other Mammals*. London: Blackwell Scientific Publications, pp. 361–366.
- Helfrecht, C. and Meehan, C. L. 2016. Sibling effects on nutritional status: Intersections of cooperation and competition across development. *American Journal of Human Biology*, 28, 159–170.
- Henrich, J. 2015. *The Secret of Our Success: How Culture Is Driving Human Evolution, Domesticating Our Species, and Making Us Smarter*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Henrich, J., Heine, S. J. and Norenzayan, A. 2010. The weirdest people in the world? *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 33, 61–83.
- Hill, K. and Hurtado, A. M. 1996. *Ache Life History: The Ecology and Demography of a Foraging People*. New York: Aldine de Gruyter.
- Hoppitt, W. and Laland, K. N. 2013. *Social Learning: An Introduction to Mechanisms, Methods, and Models*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- House of Commons 2019. *Hunger, Food Insecurity and Malnutrition in the UK*. Florence: UNICEF Office of Research.
- Howell, N. 1979. *Demography of the Dobe !Kung*. New York: Academic Press.
- Hrdy, S. B. 1999. *Mother Nature: Natural Selection and the Female of the Species*. London: Chatto & Windus.
- Hrdy, S. B. 2009. *Mothers and Others: The Evolutionary Origins of Mutual Understanding*. Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- Kaufman, G. 1992. *Shame: The Power of Caring*. Rochester, VA: Schenkman Books, Inc.
- Kilday, A.-M. 2013. *A History of Infanticide in Britain c 1600 to the Present*. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Laland, K. N. 2017. *Darwin’s Unfinished Symphony: How Culture Made the Human Mind*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Lancy, D. F. 1996. *Playing on Mother-Ground: Cultural Routines for Children’s Development*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Lancy, D. F. 2015. *The Anthropology of Childhood: Cherubs, Chattel, Changelings*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lanius, R. A., Vermetten, E. and Pain, C. 2010. *The Impact of Early Life Trauma on Health and Disease: The Hidden Epidemic*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Levine, R., Dixon, S., Levine, S., Richman, A., Liederman, P. H., Keefer, C. H. and Brazelton, T. B. 1996. *Child Care and Culture: Lessons from Africa*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lloyd, J. B. and Sieff, D. F. 2015. Return from exile: beyond self-alienation, shame and addiction to reconnect with ourselves. In: D. F. Sieff (ed.), *Understanding and Healing Emotional Trauma: Conversations with Pioneering Clinicians and Researchers*. London: Routledge, pp. 25–45.
- Madigan, S., Cyr, C., Eirich, R., Fearon, R. M. P., Ly, A., Rash, C., Poole, J. C. and Alink, L. R. A. 2019. Testing the cycle of maltreatment hypothesis: meta-analytic evidence of the intergenerational transmission of child maltreatment. *Developmental Psychopathology*, 31, 23–51.
- Mann, J. 1992. Nurturance or negligence: maternal psychology and behavioral preference among preterm twins. In: J. H. Barkow, L. Cosmides and J. Tooby (eds.), *The Adapted Mind: Evolutionary Psychology and the Generation of Culture*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 367–390.
- McDonnell, C. G., Boan, A. D., Bradley, C. C., Seay, K. D., Charles, J. M. and Carpenter, L. A. 2019. Child maltreatment in autism spectrum disorder and intellectual disability: results from a population-based sample. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, 60, 576–584.
- Mckerracher, L. J., Nepomnaschy, P., Altman, R. M., Sellen, D. and Collard, M. 2020. Breastfeeding duration and the social learning of infant feeding knowledge in two Maya communities. *Human Nature*, 31, 43–67.
- Murphy, N. 2011. Maltreatment of children with disabilities: the breaking point. *Journal of Child Neurology*, 26, 1054–1056.
- Myers, S. and Johns, S. E. 2017. Trade-offs in mother–infant bonding: a life history perspective on maternal emotional investments during infancy (poster). Presented at: 5th Annual Toulouse Economics and Biology Workshop: The Evolution and Economics of the Family. Toulouse: Institute of Advanced Studies, 1–2 June.

- Nesse, R. M. 2019. *Good Reasons for Bad Feelings: Insights from the Frontier of Evolutionary Psychiatry*. London: Penguin.
- Nisbett, R. E. and Cohen, D. 1996. *Culture of Honor: The Psychology of Violence in the South*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Nowak, A., Gelfand, M. J., Borkowski, W., Cohen, D. and Hernandez, I. 2016. The evolutionary basis of honor cultures. *Psychological Science*, 27, 12–24.
- Numan, M. and Insel, T. R. 2006. *The Neurobiology of Parental Behavior*. Berlin: Springer Science+Business Media. Olds, D. L., Sadler, L. and Kitzman,
- H. 2007. Programs for parents of infants and toddlers: recent evidence from randomized trials. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, 48, 355–391.
- Parker, R. 1995. *Mother Love/ Mother Hate: The Power of Maternal Ambivalence*. New York: Basic Books.
- Parker, R. 2012. Shame and maternal ambivalence. In: P. Mariotti (ed.), *The Maternal Lineage: Identification, Desire and Transgenerational Issues*. London: Routledge, pp. 85–112.
- Pereira, A., Handa, S. and Holmqvist, G. 2017. *Prevalence and Correlates of Food Insecurity among Children across the Globe. Innocenti Working Papers*. Florence: UNICEF Office of Research.
- Porter, T. and Gavin, H. 2010. Infanticide and neonaticide: a review of 40 years of research literature on incidence and causes. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, 11, 99–112.
- Potts, R. 2013. Hominin evolution in settings of strong environmental variability. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 73, 1–13.
- Reijman, S., Bakermans-Kranenburg, M. J., Hiraoka, R., Crouch, J. L., Milner, J. S., Alink, L. R. A. and Van Ijzendoorn, M. H. 2016. Baseline functioning and stress reactivity in maltreating parents and at-risk adults: review and meta-analyses of autonomic nervous system studies. *Child Maltreatment*, 21, 327–342.
- Scheper-Hughes, N. 1992. *Death without Weeping: The Violence of Everyday Life in Brazil*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Schiefenhövel, W. 1989. Reproduction and sex-ratio manipulation through preferential female infanticide among the Eipo, in the highlands of west New Guinea. In: A. E. Rasa, C. Vogel and E. Voland (eds.), *Sociobiology of Sexual and Reproductive Strategies*. London: Chapman and Hall, pp. 170–193.
- Sear, R. and Mace, R. 2008. Who keeps children alive? A review of the effects of kin on child survival. *Evolution and Human Behavior*, 29, 1–18.
- Sellen, D. W. 2006. Lactation, complementary feeding, and human life history. In: K. Hawkes and R. R. Paine (eds.), *The Evolution of Human Life History*. Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press, pp. 155–196.
- Sieff, D. F. 1990. Explaining biased sex ratios in human populations: a critique of recent studies. *Current Anthropology*, 31, 25–48.
- Sieff, D. F. 2015. *Understanding and Healing Emotional Trauma: Conversations with Pioneering Clinicians and Researchers*. London: Routledge.
- Sieff, D. F. 2019. The Death Mother as nature's shadow: infanticide, abandonment and the collective unconscious. *Psychological Perspectives*, 62, 15–34.
- Sieff, D. F. 2020. Trauma-worlds and their transformation: moving beyond a life built around fear, dissociation and shame [video]. YouTube. Retrieved from [www.youtube.com/watch?v=QE48YTU9Ss8](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QE48YTU9Ss8)
- Spieker, S. J. and Bensley, L. 1994. Roles of living arrangements and grandmother social support in adolescent mothering and infant attachment. *Developmental Psychology*, 30, 102–111.
- Stevenson-Hinde, J. 2011. Culture and socioemotional development, with a focus on fearfulness and attachment. In: X. Chen and K. H. Rubin (eds.), *Socioemotional Development in Cultural Context*. New York: Guilford Press, pp. 11–28.
- Terahima, H. and Hewlett, B. S. (eds.) 2016. *Social Learning and Innovation in Contemporary Hunter-Gatherers: Evolutionary and Ethnographic Perspectives*. Berlin: Springer.
- Tracy, M., Salo, M. and Appleton, A. 2018. The mitigating effects of maternal social support and paternal involvement on the intergenerational transmission of violence. *Child Abuse and Neglect*, 78, 46–59.
- Tucker, C. J. and Finkelhor, D. 2017. The state of interventions for sibling conflict and aggression: a systematic review. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, 18, 396–406.
- Van Ijzendoorn, M. H., Bakermans-Kranenburg, M. J., Coughlan, B. and Reijman, S. 2020. Annual research review: umbrella synthesis of meta-analyses on child maltreatment antecedents and interventions: differential susceptibility perspective on risk and resilience. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, 61, 272–290.
- Volk, A. A. and Atkinson, J. A. 2013. Infant and child death in the human environment of evolutionary adaptation. *Evolution and Human Behavior*, 34, 182–192.

WHO. 2020. Child maltreatment. World Health Organization. Retrieved from [www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/child-maltreatment](http://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/child-maltreatment)

Willführ, K. P. and Gagnon, A. 2013. Are stepparents always evil? Parental death, remarriage, and child survival in demographically saturated

Krummhörn (1720–1859) and expanding Québec(1670–1750). *Biodemography and Social Biology*, 59, 191–211.

Woodman, M. and Sieff, D. F. 2009. Confronting Death Mother – an interview with Marion Woodman. *Spring*, 81, 177–199.

Yengoyan, A. A. 1981. Infanticide and birth order: an empirical analysis of preferential female infanticide among Australian Aboriginal populations. *Anthropology UCLA*, 7, 255–273.