

Örneklerle Kulak-Burun-Boğaz'da Baş ve Boyun Cerrahisi'nde (KBB-BBC) Sağlık Hizmeti Kaynaklı Zararlar ve Tıbbi Kötü Uygulamalar

Nadir YILDIRIM¹

Kadir Serkan ORHAN²

Yahya GÜLDİKEN³

Tayfun KİRAZLI⁴

I. Giriş

Tıp deontolojisinin ilk öğretilen ve önemli ilkelerinden biri “*primum non nocere*” (önce zarar vermeyiniz) olmakla birlikte insan vücuduna yapılan cerrahi ya da cerrahi olmayan tanı ve tedavi amaçlı tüm girişimlerin belli bir risk içermesi ve sağlık hizmetinden doğan zararlar için doğasında vardır. Tıp teknolojisi geliştikçe bu zararlar oransal olarak artmasa bile nitelikleri değişmekte, sayılar ile birlikte bu zararlar konusunda farkındalık da artmaktadır. Buna paralel olarak özellikle son 50 yıldır tüm dünyada olduğu gibi ülkemizde de “kötü tıbbi uygulama” (*malpractice*) kavramı yerleşmiştir ve bununla bağlantılı dava sayıları da yıldan yıla neredeyse geometrik olarak artmaktadır. Bu davalardan kaçınma gayretinden bağımsız olarak sağlık hizme-

tinden elde edilecek potansiyel faydayı olası risklerin üzerine çıkarmak için çaba harcamak hekimin yükümlülüğüdür. Geliştirilen rehberler, algoritmalar, kanıta dayalı tıp ilkeleri de bu amaca yönelik çabalarla ilişkilidir.

Uzmanlık alanımız olan KBB-BBC, sağlık hizmeti zararları bakımından hem sayısal hem de oransal olarak ön planda olan uzmanlık dallarındandır. Otolaringoloji girişimlerinin çok ve çeşitli, önemli bir bölümünün seçimlik olması ile birlikte komplikasyonlarının görünür, yıkıcı ve bazen ölümcül olabilmesi bunun en önemli nedenleridir. İlgilendiğimiz anatomik alandan kafa çiftleri, ana damarlar, sindirim ve solunum yolları gibi kritik yapıların geçiyor olması, bu bölgenin kan ve lenf dolaşımı bakımından vücudun diğer yerlerinden daha zengin olması, ayrıca, baş ve boyun bölgesindeki oluşumların kafa

¹ Prof. Dr., Kütahya Sağlık Bilimleri Üniversitesi, Tıp Fakültesi KBB Hastalıkları AD., nadir.yildirim@ksbu.edu.tr

² Prof. Dr., İstanbul Üniversitesi, İstanbul (Çapa) Tıp Fakültesi, KBB Hastalıkları AD., Adli Tıp Kurumu ksorhanistanbul.edu.tr

³ Prof. Dr., İstanbul Üniversitesi, İstanbul (Çapa) Tıp Fakültesi, KBB Hastalıkları AD., Adli Tıp Kurumu, yahya.guldikenistanbul.edu.tr

⁴ Prof. Dr., Ege Üniversitesi, Tıp Fakültesi, KBB Hastalıkları AD., Türk KBB-BBC Derneği Başkanı, tayfunkirazli@gmail.com

deneyimleri yaşamış) meslektaşlarından aldıkları uyarı ve geri bildirimlerin etkili olduğunu ve bu yöntemin sağlık hizmeti kaynaklı zararları ve hasta şikayetlerini (muhtemelen davaları) azaltmada da etkili olabileceğini göstermiş (72).

Kaynaklar

1. <https://en.wikipedia.org>
2. Voultsos P, Oliva A, Grassi S, Palmiero D, Spagnolo AG. Are errors in otorhinolaryngology always a sign of medical malpractice? Review of the literature and new perspectives in the SARS-CoV-2 (COVID-19) era *Acta Otorhinolaryngologica Italica* 2020;40:157-163; doi: 10.14639/0392-100X-N0674
3. Ceremsak J, Miller LE, Gomez ED. A Review of Otolaryngology Malpractice Cases with Associated Court Proceedings from 2010 to 2019 *Laryngoscope* 2020 Nov doi: 10.1002/lary.29232. Online ahead of print.
4. Navaratnam AV, Hariri A, Ho C, Machin JT, Wr Briggs T, Marshall A. Otorhinolaryngology litigation in England: 727 clinical negligence cases against the National Health Service *Clin Otolaryngol*. 2021 Jan;46(1):9-15. doi: 10.1111/coa.13646. Epub 2020 Oct 2.
5. Nikoghosyan-Bossen G, Hauberg A, Homøe P. Increased number of ear-nose-throat malpractice complaints in Denmark *Dan Med J*. 2012 May;59(5):A4321
6. Balch CM, Oreskovich MR, Dyrbye LN et al. Personal consequences of malpractice lawsuits on American surgeons. *J Am Coll Surg* 2011;213:657-67. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jamcollsurg.2011.08.005>
7. N Apaydin, S Çomoğlu, Y Özer, H Avci, H Eş, K S Orhan. Medicolegal aspects of rhinology practice *J Laryngol Otol*. 2016 Oct;130(10):897-901.
8. Patel A, Harrison R, Oremule B. What can we learn from the last 20 years: A review of litigation trends in otolaryngology *Surgeon*. 2020 Apr;18(2):75-79. doi: 10.1016/j.surge.2019.06.001. Epub 2019 Jul 20.
9. Hiyama T. Otorhinolaryngology litigations in Japan *Eur Arch Otorhinolaryngol*. 2019 Oct;276(10):2947-2951. doi: 10.1007/s00405-019-05561-y. Epub 2019 Jul 18.
10. Sheikh A, Ali S, Ejaz S, Farooqi M, Ahmed SS, Jawaid I. Malpractice awareness among surgeons at a teaching hospital in Pakistan. *Patient Safety in Surgery* 2012, 6:26 <http://www.pssjournal.com/content/6/1/26>
11. Li H, Dong S, Liao Z, Yao Y, Yuan S, Cui Y, Li G. Retrospective analysis of medical malpractice claims in tertiary hospitals of China: the view from patient safety *BMJ Open*. 2020 Sep 24;10(9):e034681. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2019-034681.
12. Agarwal R, Gupta A, Gupta S. The impact of tort reform on defensive medicine, quality of care, and physician supply: A systematic review *Health Serv Res*. 2019;54:851-859.
13. Breen CT, Mehra S. An Analysis of Otolaryngology Medical Malpractice Payments From the National Practitioner Data Bank. *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 2020 Jul 21;194599820942498. doi: 10.1177/0194599820942498. Online ahead of print.
14. Cherry J, Weir R. The Future of ORL-HNS and Associated Specialties Series *Medicolegal and ethical aspects of ORL-HNS in the new millennium The Journal of Laryngology & Otology* October 2000, Vol. 114, pp. 737-740
15. Norris DC. Medico-legal hazards in ear, nose and throat surgery *Proc R Soc Med*. 1962 Nov;55(11):950-5.
16. Savage JR, Weiner GM. Litigation in otolaryngology - trends and recommendations *J Laryngol Otol*. 2006 Dec;120(12):1001-4. doi: 10.1017/S0022215106001812. Epub 2006 Oct 24.
17. Svider PF, Husain Q, Kovalerchik O, Mauro AC, Setzen M, Baredes S, Eloy JA. Determining legal responsibility in otolaryngology: a review of 44 trials since 2008. *Am J Otolaryngol*. 2013 Nov-Dec;34(6):699-705. doi: 10.1016/j.amjoto.2012.12.005. Epub 2013 Jan 16.
18. Nikoghosyan-Bossen G, Hauberg A, Homøe P. Systematic analysis of ear-nose-throat malpractice complaints may be beneficial for patient safety *Dan Med J*. 2012 May;59(5):A4422.
19. Windfuhr JP. Laryngorhinootologie (Faults and failure of tonsil surgery and other standard procedures in otorhinolaryngology) (Article in German) 2013 Apr;92 Suppl 1:S33-72. doi: 10.1055/s-0032-1333253. Epub 2013 Apr 26.
20. Dawson DE, Kraus EM. Medical malpractice and rhinology. *Am J Rhinol*. 2007 Sep-Oct;21(5):584-90. doi: 10.2500/ajr.2007.21.3076.
21. Hong SS, Yheulon CG, Wirtz ED, Sniezek JC. Otolaryngology and medical malpractice: A review of the past decade, 2001-2011 *Laryngoscope*. 2014 Apr;124(4):896-901. doi: 10.1002/lary.24377. Epub 2013 Oct 7.
22. Tajudeen BA, Kennedy DW. Thirty years of endoscopic sinus surgery: What have we learned? *World J Otorhinolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2017 Jan 21;3(2):115-121. doi: 10.1016/j.wjorl.2016.12.001. eCollection 2017 Jun.
23. Lund VJ, Wright A DM, Yiotakis J. Complications and medicolegal aspects of endoscopic sinus surgery *J R Soc Med* 1997;90:422-428
24. Stankiewicz JA. Complications in endoscopic intranasal ethmoidectomy: an update. *Laryngoscope* 1989;99:686-90
25. Lydiatt DD, Sewell RK. Medical malpractice and sinonasal disease. *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 2008 Nov;139(5):677-81. doi: 1
26. Tolisano AM, Justin GA, Ruhl DS, Cable BB. Rhinology and medical malpractice: An update of the medicolegal landscape of the last ten years *Laryngoscope*. 2016 Jan;126(1):14-9. doi: 10.1002/lary.25533. Epub 2015 Aug 8.
27. Geyton T, Odutoye T, Mathew R. A report on 15 years of clinical negligence claims in rhinology *Am J Rhinol*

- Allergy . Nov-Dec 2014;28(6):219-23.doi: 10.2500/ajra.2014.28.4118. 0.1016/j.otohns.2008.06.027.
28. Bismark MM, Gogos AJ, McCombe D, Clark RB, Gruen RL, Studdert DM. Legal disputes over informed consent for cosmetic procedures: a descriptive study of negligence claims and complaints in Australia. *J Plast Reconstr Aesthet Surg* 2012 Nov;65(11):1506-12. doi: 10.1016/j.bjps.2012.05.004. Epub 2012 May 30.
 29. Winford TW, Wallin JL, Clinger JD, Graham AM. Malpractice in treatment of sinonasal disease by otolaryngologists: a review of the past 10 years. *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 2015 Mar;152(3):536-40. doi: 10.1177/0194599814566787. Epub 2015 Jan 8.
 30. Eloy JA, Svider PF, D'Aguillo CM, Baredes S, Setzen M, Folbe AJ. Int Forum Allergy Rhinol Image-guidance in endoscopic sinus surgery: is it associated with decreased medicolegal liability? . 2013 Dec;3(12):980-5. doi: 10.1002/alr.21210.Epub 2013 Aug 26.
 31. Kreimer S. Managing risk: how to prevent patient injury and avoid lawsuits. *Med Econ* 2013; 90:46-49.
 32. Blake DM, Svider PF, Carniol ET, et al. Malpractice in otology. *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 2013; 149:554-561.
 33. Ruhl DS, Hong SS, Littlefield PD. Lessons learned in otologic surgery: 30 years of malpractice cases in the United States. *Otol Neurotol* 2013; 34:1173-1179.
 34. Tolisano AM, Song SA, Ruhl DS, Littlefield PD. Dizziness, malpractice, and the otolaryngologist *Am J Otolaryngol* Jul-Aug 2017;38(4):401-404.
 35. Mathew R, Asimacopoulos E, Valentine P. Toward safer practice in otology: a report on 15 years of clinical negligence claims. *Laryngoscope* 2011; 121:2214-2219.
 36. Ruhl DS, Littlefield PD. Updates in medical malpractice: an otology perspective *Curr Opin Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2015 Oct;23(5):348-54. doi: 10.1097/MOO.0000000000000182.
 37. Dew LA, Shelton C. Iatrogenic facial nerve injury: prevalence and predisposing factors. *Ear Nose Throat J* 1996; 75:724-729.
 38. Svider PF, Peter L, Sunaryo PL, Brieze R, Keeley BR, Olga Kovalerchik O, Mauro AC, Eloy JA. Characterizing Liability for Cranial Nerve Injuries: A Detailed Analysis of 209 Malpractice Trials. *Laryngoscope*, 123:1156-1162, 2013
 39. Reilly BK, Horn GM, Sewell RK. Hearing loss resulting in malpractice litigation: what physicians need to know *Laryngoscope* 2013 Jan;123(1):112-7.
 40. Ruhl DS, Cable BB, Martell DW. Medication associated with hearing loss: 25 years of medical malpractice cases in the United States. *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 2014; 151:431-437.
 41. Simonsen AR, Duncavage JA, Becker SS. Malpractice in head and neck surgery: a review of cases *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2012 Jul;147(1):69-73. doi: 10.1177/0194599812439152.Epub 2012 Feb 27.
 42. Lydiatt DD. Medical malpractice and head and neck cancer. 2004 Apr;12(2):71-5. *Curr Opin Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* doi: 10.1097/00020840-200404000-00003.
 43. Epstein JB, Kish RV, Hallajian L, Sciubba J. Head and neck, oral, and oropharyngeal cancer: a review of medicolegal cases. *Oral Surg Oral Med Oral Pathol Oral Radiol*. 2015 Feb;119(2):177-86. doi: 10.1016/j.oooo.2014.10.002. Epub 2014 Oct 15.
 44. Lydiatt DD. Medical malpractice and cancer of the larynx. *Laryngoscope*. 2002 Mar;112(3):445-8. doi: 10.1097/00005537-200203000-00007.
 45. Lydiatt DD, Sewell R. Medical malpractice and transoral robotic surgery: Evaluation and some preemptive thoughts *Ear Nose Throat J*. 2017 Dec;96(12):477-480.
 46. Lydiatt DD. Cancer of the oral cavity and medical malpractice *Laryngoscope*. 2002 May;112(5):816-9. doi: 10.1097/00005537-200205000-00009.
 47. Harréus U. Urgical errors and risks - the head and neck cancer patient. *GMS Curr Top Otorhinolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2013. PMID: 24403972
 48. Gartland RM, Bloom JB, Parangi S, Hodin R, DeRoo C, Stephen AE, Narra V, Lubitz CC, Mort E. A Long, Unnerving Road: Malpractice Claims Involving the Surgical Management of Thyroid and Parathyroid Disease *World J Surg*. 2019 Nov;43(11):2850-2855. doi: 10.1007/s00268-019-05102-y.
 49. Gambardella C, Polistena A, Sanguinetti A, Patrone R, Napolitano S, Esposito D, Testa D, Marotta V, Faggiano A, Calò PG, Avenia N, Conzo G. Unintentional recurrent laryngeal nerve injuries following thyroidectomy: Is it the surgeon who pays the bill? *Int J Surg*. 2017 May;41 Suppl 1:S55-S59. doi: 10.1016/j.ijssu.2017.01.112.
 50. Singer MC, Iverson KC, Terris DJ. Thyroidectomy-related malpractice claims *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 2012 Mar;146(3):358-61. doi: 10.1177/0194599811430898. Epub 2012 Jan 4.
 51. Swonke ML, Shakibai N, Chaaban MR. Medical Malpractice Trends in Thyroidectomies among General Surgeons and Otolaryngologists *OTO Open*. 2020 May 13;4(2):2473974X20921141. doi: 10.1177/2473974X20921141.eCollection Apr-Jun 2020.
 52. Shaw GY, Pierce E. Malpractice litigation involving iatrogenic surgical vocal fold paralysis: a closed-claims review with recommendations for prevention and management *Ann Otol Rhinol Laryngol*. 2009 Jan;118(1):6-12. doi: 10.1177/000348940911800102.
 53. Abadin SS, Kaplan EL, Angelos P. Malpractice litigation after thyroid surgery: the role of recurrent laryngeal nerve injuries, 1989-2009 *Surgery* 2010 Oct;148(4):718-22; discussion 722-3. doi: 10.1016/j.surg.2010.07.019.Epub 2010 Aug 14.
 54. Hong SS, Yheulon CG, Sniezek JC. Salivary gland surgery and medical malpractice. *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2013 Apr;148(4):589-94. doi: 10.1177/0194599813475566. Epub 2013 Feb 4.
 55. Rose C, Svider PF, Sheyn A, Meadows LN, Eloy JA, Cotichia J, Folbe AJ. Protecting the most vulnerable:

- litigation from pediatric otolaryngologic procedures and conditions. *Laryngoscope*. 2014 Sep;124(9):2161-6. doi: 10.1002/lary.24663. Epub 2014 Apr 29.
56. Subramanyam R, Varughese A, Willging JP, Sadhasivam S. Future of pediatric tonsillectomy and perioperative outcomes *Int J Pediatr Otorhinolaryngol*. 2013 Feb;77(2):194-9. doi: 10.1016/j.ijporl.2012.10.016. Epub 2012 Nov 16.
 57. Stevenson AN, Myer CM 3rd, Shuler MD, Singer PS. Complications and legal outcomes of tonsillectomy malpractice claims. *Laryngoscope*. 2012 Jan;122(1):71-4. doi: 10.1002/lary.22438. Epub 2011 Nov 10. PMID: 22076638
 58. Windfuhr JP. Malpractice claims and unintentional outcome of tonsil surgery and other standard procedures in otorhinolaryngology *GMS Curr Top Otorhinolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2013 Dec 13;12:Doc08. doi: 10.3205/cto000100.
 59. Ong AA, Kelly A, Castillo GA, Carr MM, Sherris DA. Characterization of Medical Malpractice Litigation after Rhinoplasty in the United States. *Aesthet Surg J*. 2020 Dec 17:sjaa380. doi: 10.1093/asj/sjaa380. Online ahead of print. PMID: 33331894
 60. Reichert M, Scheithauer M, Hoffmann TK, Hellings P, Picavet V. (What rhinoplasty surgeons should know about body dysmorphic disorder (BDD)) *Laryngorhinootologie*. 2014 Aug;93(8):507-13. doi: 10.1055/s-0034-1371825. Epub 2014 Jul 29.
 61. Rhee JS, McMullin BT. Measuring outcomes in facial plastic surgery: a decade of progress *Curr Opin Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2008 Aug;16(4):387-93. doi: 10.1097/MOO.0b013e3283031ac9.
 62. Saleh HA, Beegun I, Apaydin F. Outcomes in Rhinoplasty *Facial Plast Surg*. 2019 Feb;35(1):47-52. doi: 10.1055/s-0039-1677829. Epub 2019 Feb 13.
 63. Kandinov A, Mutchnick S, Nangia V, Svider PF, Zuliani GF, Shkoukani MA, Carron MA. Analysis of Factors Associated With Rhytidectomy Malpractice Litigation Cases. *JAMA Facial Plast Surg*. 2017 Jul 1;19(4):255-259. doi: 10.1001/jamafacial.2016.1782.
 64. Rayess HM, Svider PF, Hanba C, Patel VS, DeJoseph LM, Carron M, Zuliani GF. A Cross-sectional Analysis of Adverse Events and Litigation for Injectable Fillers. *JAMA Facial Plast Surg*. 2018 May 1;20(3):207-214. doi: 10.1001/jamafacial.2017.1888.
 65. Bruyneel M, Ninane V. Unattended home-based polysomnography for sleep disordered breathing: current concepts and perspectives *Sleep Med Rev*. 2014 Aug;18(4):341-7. doi: 10.1016/j.smrv.2013.12.002. Epub 2013 Dec 12.
 66. Kayyali HA, Weimer S, Frederick C, Martin C, Basa D, Juguilon JA, Juglioni F. Remotely attended home monitoring of sleep disorders *Telemed J E Health*. 2008 May;14(4):371-4. doi: 10.1089/tmj.2007.0058.
 67. Fields BG. Regulatory, Legal, and Ethical Considerations of Telemedicine *Sleep Med Clin*. 2020 Sep;15(3):409-416. doi: 10.1016/j.jsmc.2020.06.004. Epub 2020 Jul 7.
 68. Tolisano AM, Bager JM. Sleep surgery and medical malpractice *Laryngoscope*. 2014 Jun;124(6):E250-4. doi: 10.1002/lary.24559. Epub 2014 Jan 17.
 69. Goh YH, Choy DK. Omission of polysomnography in treatment of snoring: common reasons and medico-legal implications *J Laryngol Otol*. 2000 Jul;114(7):519-21. doi: 10.1258/0022215001906273.
 70. Svider PF, Pashkova AA, Folbe AJ, Eloy JD, Setzen M, Baredes S, Eloy JA. Obstructive sleep apnea: strategies for minimizing liability and enhancing patient safety *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2013 Dec;149(6):947-53. doi: 10.1177/0194599813504074. Epub 2013 Sep 11.
 71. Ruhl DS, Siegal G. Medical Malpractice Implications of Clinical Practice Guidelines *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2017 Aug;157(2):175-177. doi: 10.1177/0194599817707943. Epub 2017 Jun 6.
 72. Nassiri AM, Pichert JW, Domenico HJ, Galloway MD, Cooper WO, Bennett ML. Unsolicited Patient Complaints among Otolaryngologists *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg*. 2019 May;160(5):810-817. doi: 10.1177/0194599818823706. Epub 2019 Jan 15.